**HOUSE . . . . . . . No. 2083** 

By Mrs. Paulsen of Belmont, petition of Anne M. Paulsen and others for legislation to increase consumer choice for motor vehicle insurance. Financial Services.

## The Commonwealth of Massachusetts

## PETITION OF:

Anne M. Paulsen Michael Ross John Hayes Stephen Murphy Ellen Story Maureen Feeney J. James Marzilli, Jr. William Walczak Dermot Shea Kay Khan Douglas W. Petersen Michael E. Festa Deborah D. Blumer Alice K. Wolf Denis E. Guyer Barry Mullen Patricia D. Jehlen Michael Dukakis Benjamin Swan John W. Scibak Matthew C. Patrick **Byron Rushing Shirley Owens-Hicks** Peter J. Larkin Jay R. Kaufman Stephen Kulik Chuck Turner Mary E. Grant Barbara A. L'Italien Felix Arroyo

In the Year Two Thousand and Five.

AN ACT TO ESTABLISH CONSUMER CHOICE IN AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE.

Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representatives in General Court assembled, and by the authority of the same, as follows:

- 1 SECTION 1. The purpose of this act is to restructure the
- 2 Massachusetts automobile insurance system by the addition of an
- 3 option of a full no-fault bodily injury insurance policy to our cur-
- 4 rent limited no-fault policy (hereinafter referred to as "hybrid per-
- 5 sonal injury protection").

This bill is filed in conjunction with three other bills, the intentions of which are to establish a special research commission to evaluate competition in the automobile insurance market; to limit liability settlements for uninsured motorists (commonly known as "no-pay, no-play"); and, to increase the funding and staffing of the Division of Insurance.

Many other concerns, such as the handling of group coverages, 12 13 increased penalties for insurance fraud, regulation of medical providers, and formation of an insurance consumers' association, are likely to be the subjects of other bills to be submitted to the 16 Joint Insurance Committee and to the Legislature. The absence of any mention of those other concerns in these four bills is in no 17 18 way intended to minimize the significance of these other concerns or to indicate either approval or disapproval of the changes pro-20 posed in those other bills. Rather, it is the stated intent of this bill to focus attention solely on the specific areas of choice/no-fault and its greater affordability for all insureds and especially for urban motorists, with the objective that these specific features be incorporated into the final composite proposed legislation of the 25 Joint Insurance Committee, along with any others of the above-26 mentioned concerns, for presentation to the Legislature for their 27 consideration and approval.

- SECTION 2. In order to apply the definitions of Chapter 34A of the General Laws to the new sections added herein, Section 34A of Chapter 90 of the General Laws, as appearing in the 2002 Official Edition, is hereby amended by striking out, in line 2, the words "thirty-four N" and inserting in place thereof the words: "thirty-four W".
- SECTION 3. In order to add new definitions to Chapter 90 of the General Laws, Section 34A of Chapter 90, as above, is hereby further amended by inserting the following:
- 4 After line 2, add the following:
- 5 "Accidental bodily injury": bodily injury, sickness, disease, or 6 death resulting therefrom, arising out of the ownership, operation, 7 or use of a motor vehicle, or while occupying such vehicle, which 8 is accidental as to the person injured.
- 9 After line 27, add the following:

- 10 "Economic loss": objectively verifiable pecuniary loss caused
- 11 by an accident for reasonable and necessary medical and rehabili-
- 12 tation expenses, loss of earnings, funeral costs, and replacement
- 13 services loss.
- "Full personal injury protection" (or "full PIP"): a personal
- 15 injury protection policy which does not include recovery for pain
- 16 and suffering as described in section 6D of chapter 231, except as
- 17 described in Section 34W, and for which the minimum level of
- 18 coverage per person, as referred to above, is twenty thousand dol-
- 19 lars.
- 20 After line 30, add the following:
- 21 "Hybrid personal injury protection" (or "hybrid PIP"), a per-
- 22 sonal injury protection policy which includes recovery for pain
- 23 and suffering as described in section 6D of chapter 231; the so-
- 24 called no-fault system in effect up through the year 2004 CE,
- 25 with a monetary threshold of \$2000 and a maximum level of cov-
- 26 erage per person of eight thousand dollars.
- 27 After line 121, add the following:
- 28 "Noneconomic loss", subjective nonmonetary loss recognized
- 29 under applicable Massachusetts law.
- 30 After line 243, add the following:
- 31 "Tort maintenance coverage": insurance coverage required of
- 32 an insured who chooses the hybrid PIP insurance coverage
- 33 whereby that insured may claim for liability based on fault above
- 34 any relevant tort threshold against their own insurer to the extent
- 35 of the coverage.
- 36 "Uncompensated economic loss": that portion of economic loss
- 37 arising out of an accidental bodily injury of an insured person that
- 88 exceeds any benefits provided by personal injury protection cov-
- 39 erage or collateral sources.
- 1 SECTION 4. In order to establish the minimum personal injury
- 2 protection limits, Section 34A of Chapter 90, as above, is hereby
- 3 further amended by striking out, in line 155, the words "of at least
- 4 eight thousand dollars" and inserting in place thereof the
- 5 following words: "of the amount specified herein below".
- 1 SECTION 5. In order to allow personal injury protection
- 2 insureds to sue the other party for losses above their policy limits

7

12

16

3 and to sue for noneconomic as well as economic losses under certain special circumstances, Section 34M of Chapter 90, as above, is hereby amended by adding at the end of the current section the following words:

"A full personal injury protection insured who is involved in an accident with an insured covered under either hybrid personal injury protection or full personal injury protection retains the right based on fault to claim from that other insured for uncompensated economic loss (and not for noneconomic loss).

"A hybrid personal injury protection insured who is involved in 13 an accident with an insured covered under either hybrid personal 14 injury protection or full personal injury protection retains the right 15 based on fault to claim from that other insured for uncompensated economic and noneconomic loss.

17 "A personal injury protection insured may claim for both eco-18 nomic and noneconoimic losses from an uninsured motorist who is liable for damages caused by the accident, from a motorist who was under the influence of alcohol or illegal drugs at the time of the accident and whose conduct was the proximate cause of the accident, from a person who caused an injury while seeking to 23 intentionally injure another person, and from any other person who is not affected by the limitations on tort rights and liabilities of this chapter and whose conduct was the proximate cause of the 26 accident."

1 SECTION 6. In order to add new sections to Chapter 90 relative to the choice of hybrid personal injury protection or full personal injury protection, to the priority of claims, to the verification of benefits, to proceedings involving out-of-state policies, and to the tort maintenance coverage, Chapter 90, as above, is hereby amended by adding after Section 34R the following new 7 sections:

8 Section 34S. Choice of a hybrid personal injury protection policy or a full personal injury protection policy.

10 (a) Upon the earliest and first renewal of any applicable motor vehicle insurance policy on or after the effective date of this act, or prior to the issuance of a policy required by this act, a choice must be made of a hybrid personal injury protection policy or of a 14 full personal injury protection policy as described in section 34A. 23

37

40 41

42

43

45

15 A choice made pursuant to this act is binding with respect to any 16 continuation, renewal, or reinstatement of an applicable motor 17 vehicle insurance policy, and continues with respect to any policy 18 or policies which extend, change, supersede, or replace the policy unless a named insured subsequently makes a different choice in writing. A choice by a named insured shall be on a form approved by the commissioner of insurance and provided by the 22 insurer.

- (b) A choice by one named insured binds all the other insureds 24 listed on that policy and all other resident relatives pursuant to the rules of subsection (c) below.
- (c)(1) If there are two or more policies in the household, each 26 with a different named insured, each such person shall have the 27 right to choose either a hybrid personal injury protection policy or a full personal injury protection for himself or herself. That per-30 son's choice shall determine that person's right no matter which vehicle he or she is occupying or which vehicle he or she might be 32 struck by. The rights of all resident relatives of those named insureds who are not motor vehicle owners shall be governed by the choice applicable to the motor vehicle which they were occupying at the time of injury, if that vehicle was owned by a resident 36 relative.
  - (2) In the event of a bodily injury occurring after the effective date of this law, but prior to the effective date of the earliest and first renewal of a motor vehicle insurance policy requiring a choice, the hybrid personal injury protection policy will be applicable.
  - (3) In the event of a conflicting choice within the household creating questions as to the applicability of a hybrid personal injury protection policy or a full personal injury protection policy, the personal injury protection policy will be applicable.
- 46 (d) The choice between a hybrid personal injury protection policy and a full personal injury protection policy shall be applicable to every motor vehicle of the owner. In the event an owner of more than one vehicle chooses different alternatives, the latest choice prior to the accident giving rise to a claim governs and, in the event of simultaneous choices, the hybrid personal injury protection policy governs. If any person fails to choose prior to a 53 motor vehicle accident, and subsection (c) (2) above does not

68

69

75

54 apply, he or she is conclusively presumed to have chosen the 55 hybrid personal injury protection policy as described in Section 56 34A.

- (e) Said choice or otherwise being bound to a hybrid personal 57 58 injury protection policy or full personal injury protection policy shall be considered voluntary. Provided that the insured shall 60 have completed the form described in Section 17 of this act, no agent, broker, insurer, or employee of an agent, broker, or insurer shall be held liable for damages resulting from the election or 63 failure to elect, unless that person's conduct is or was willful or 64 wanton.
- 65 Section 34T. Priority of claims.
- Subject to section 34S, the priority of claims applicable to an 66 67 injury shall be as follows:
  - (a) The priority of claims shall be as follows:
- (1) An occupant of a motor vehicle who suffers bodily injury 70 shall be covered by the motor vehicle insurance policy under which he or she is insured as a named insured or resident relative.
- 72 (2) In the event that an occupant is not insured under a motor 73 vehicle insurance policy in (1) above, the occupant shall be covered under the owner's motor vehicle insurance policy.
- (3) In the event that neither (1) nor (2) above apply, the occu-76 pant shall be covered under the operator's motor vehicle insurance policy. Provided, however, if the injury occurs in a motor vehicle 78 being used in the business of transporting people for a fee, or in a motor vehicle furnished by the injured person's employer, the 80 injured person has the choice of claiming under the personal 81 injury protection policy applicable to the vehicle instead of his or 82 her own coverage.
- (b) Once said choice is exercised by the injured person as set 83 forth in subsection (a), then in no event shall the limit of liability 84 for any uninsured motorists coverage which would possibly apply, be added to or stacked upon the personal injury protection policy which applies to the injured person's choice.
- 88 (c) An insurer may exclude coverage under a personal injury 89 protection policy where the named insured or any resident relative 90 who does not own a motor vehicle is injured while occupying a 91 motor vehicle owned by the named insured but which is not 92 described in that insurance policy's declaration page.

- 93 Section 34U. Verification of entitlement benefits.
- 94 (a) Every employer shall furnish the information on a form 95 approved by the commissioner regarding an employee who has 96 filed a claim for personal injury protection benefits if a request is 97 made by an insurer providing such benefits under this chapter.
- 98 (b) Every physician, hospital, clinic, or other medical institu-99 tion providing, before or after an injury resulting from a motor 100 vehicle accident, upon which a claim for personal injury protection benefits is based, any products, services, or treatment in rela-102 tion to that or any other injury, or in relation to a condition 103 claimed to be connected with that or any other injury shall, if 104 requested to do so by the personal injury protection insurer 105 against whom the claim has been made, furnish a written report of 106 the history, condition, and treatment, and the dates and cost of 107 such treatment, of the injured person. Such information shall be 108 provided together with a sworn statement that the treatment of 109 services rendered were reasonable and necessary with respect to 110 the injury sustained and identifying which portion of the expense 111 for such treatment or services was incurred as a result of such 112 injury. Every such physician, hospital, clinic, or other medical 113 institution shall also promptly produce and permit the inspection and copying of its records regarding such history, condition, and 115 treatment, and the dates and costs of treatment. The sworn statement required under this section shall read as follows: 116

"Under penalty of perjury I declare that I have read the foregoing and the facts alleged are true, to the best of my knowledge and belief."

No cause of action for violation of a physician-patient privilege or invasion of the right of privacy is allowed against any physician, hospital, clinic, or other medical institution complying with the provisions of this section. The person requesting records and a sworn statement under this subsection shall pay all reasonable costs connected therewith.

126 (c) In the event of any dispute regarding the personal injury 127 protection insurer's right to discovery of facts about an injured 128 person, a court of record may enter an order for such discovery as 129 justice requires.

- 130 Section 34V. Out-of-state policies.
- 131 (a) Each insurer authorized to transact or transacting business 132 in this state shall file with the commissioner, as a condition of its continued transactions of business with the Commonwealth, a form approved by the commissioner declaring that any contract of 135 motor vehicle liability insurance, wherever issued, covering the 136 maintenance or use of a motor vehicle while the motor vehicle is 137 in this state is deemed to provide the insurance required for tradi-138 tional liability policies issued in this state, unless the named
- 139 insured, prior to a motor vehicle accident within this state, has
- 140 chosen a personal injury protection policy under this chapter in 141 which case the out-of-state policy is deemed to provide the insur-
- 142 ance required for a personal injury protection policy. Any nonad-
- 143 mitted insurer may also file such a form.
- (b) A person whose policy is deemed to incorporate the tradi-144 145 tional liability policy requirements under subsection (a) shall be
- deemed to be a traditional liability policy insured. A person whose policy is deemed to incorporate the personal injury protec-
- 148 tion policy requirements under subsection (a) shall be deemed to
- 149 be a personal injury protection insured subject to this act. If a
- 150 policy under subsection (a) also provides coverage in excess of or
- 151 in addition to that required for a traditional liability or a personal
- 152 injury protection policy, that excess or additional coverage shall
- 153 also apply.
- 154 Section 34W. Tort maintenance system.
- (a) Every insurer offering hybrid personal injury protection 155
- 156 coverage shall offer, and every insured who chooses hybrid per-
- sonal injury protection shall be required to purchase, tort mainte-157
- 158 nance coverage at a level that is at least equivalent to the
- 159 minimum required bodily injury level. Such coverage shall allow
- 160 such insured to claim against their own insurer for liability based
- 161 on fault above the relevant tort threshold up to the extent of the
- 162 coverage.
  - 1 SECTION 7. In order that consumers become as fully aware as
  - 2 possible of the consequences of the choices of hybrid personal
  - 3 injury protection and full personal injury protection, Chapter 175
  - 4 of the General Laws, as above, is hereby amended by adding after
  - 5 Section 3C the following new section:

6 Section 3D. The Commissioner of Insurance shall conduct, or 7 cause the insurance companies to conduct, effective ongoing informational programs in order to assist the public to understand the choices of hybrid personal injury protection and full personal injury protection available to an insurer or obligor relative to automobile insurance, as described in Chapter 90, and the ramifications of these choices. Such informational programs shall include, but not be limited to, information relative to the comparative costs of insurance under the hybrid personal injury protection policy and the full personal injury protection policy, and the benefits, 16 rights, and obligations of insurers and insureds under each such 17 policy.

18 The Commissioner of Insurance shall prepare a standardized 19 form or forms on which an insured or obligor as above shall indi-20 cate, by initialing or in some other affirmative manner, that said insured or obligor understands the choices available to him or her, as described in said Chapter 90, and voluntarily accepts the ramifications of the selected choice. Said form or forms shall include the information relative to comparative costs, benefits, rights, and obligations described above. The Commissioner shall distribute a sample copy of such form or forms to all companies licensed to do motor vehicle insurance business in the Commonwealth. A copy of such form or forms shall be required to be completed as part of any new motor vehicle insurance contract, and of any change of choice of policy in such contract, between the company and the 31 insured or obligor.

1 SECTION 8. In order to allow optional higher personal injury protection benefit levels, Section 113C of Chapter 175 of the General Laws, as above, is hereby amended by inserting after line 26 the following words:

5 Similarly, such insurers shall offer additional personal injury protection coverage beyond that required by section thirty-four A of chapter ninety, to bring such benefit levels up to fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000), one hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000), two 9 hundred and fifty thousand dollars (\$250,000), five hundred thou-10 sand dollars (\$500,000), and one million dollars (\$1,000,000) for all eligible victims, and any other amounts determined by the

12 Commissioner of Insurance to be reasonable.

- 1 SECTION 9. In order to void the current monetary and verbal
- 2 thresholds for full personal injury protection policies while main-
- 3 taining them for hybrid personal injury protection policies,
- 4 Section 6D of Chapter 231 of the General Laws, as above, is
- 5 hereby amended as follows:
- 6 By adding after the words "a plaintiff" in line 4 the words:
- 7 "insured under a hybrid personal injury protection policy as
- 8 described in section 34A";9 By adding at the end of the current section the words:
- 10 "A plaintiff insured under a full personal injury protection
- 11 policy as described in section 34A is not eligible to recover for
- 12 damages for pain and suffering."
- 1 SECTION 10. In order to fairly assess and distribute the costs
- 2 of claims above tort maintenance coverage limits, the Commis-
- 3 sioner of Insurance shall be directed to develop a facility to reallo-
- 4 cate the expenses incurred by the successful claims of hybrid
- 5 personal injury protection insureds against full personal injury
- 6 protection insureds for both noneconomic and economic losses
- 7 above the relevant tort maintenance coverage limits, as stated in
- 8 Section 34M of Chapter 90 of the General Laws as modified by
- 9 Section 5 of this act, such as to assure that the advantage of tort
- 10 claim waivers by personal injury protection insureds against
- 11 hybrid personal injury protection insureds is reflected in the pre-
- 12 miums of full personal injury protection insureds.
- 13 To facilitate this development, the Commissioner of Insurance
- 14 is authorized to benefit from information about such a facility
- 15 from the experience of other states, including but not limited to
- 16 the experience of the State of New Jersey where such a facility is
- 17 currently in operation.
- 18 As specified in Section 12 of this act, this reallocation facility
- 19 is to be established and ready for operation prior to the initiation
- 20 of the automobile insurance system described in this act.
- 1 SECTION 11. The provisions of this act are severable, and if
- 2 any part of this act shall be adjudged unconstitutional or otherwise
- 3 invalid by any court of competent jurisdiction, the validity of the
- 4 remaining parts shall not be affected thereby.

- 1 SECTION 12. This act shall take effect nine (9) months from
- 2 the date of its enactment, or on January first of the year two thou-
- 3 sand and six, whichever date is later, except 1) that the provisions
- 4 of Section 10 of this act are to be commenced immediately upon
- 5 enactment of this act and shall be completed prior to that effective
- 6 date, and 2) that any preparatory actions necessary to permit the
- 7 other sections of this act to be effective on that date shall be
- 8 allowed to proceed prior to that date.